Darwin Initiative Main Annual Report

To be completed with reference to the "Writing a Darwin/IWT Report" Information Note: (https://www.darwininitiative.org.uk/resources-for-projects/reporting-forms-change-request-forms-and-terms-and-conditions/).

It is expected that this report will be a **maximum** of 20 pages in length, excluding annexes)

Submission Deadline: 30th April 2021

Darwin Project Information

Project reference	IWTR6S2\1029
Project title	Dismantling wildlife trafficking cybercrime networks in Southeast Asia
Country/ies	Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore
Lead organisation	Durrell Institute of Conservation and Ecology (DICE), University of Kent (UoK)
Partner institution(s)	Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), Indonesian Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF), Indonesian National Police (INP), Indonesian Attorney General's Office (AGO), Indonesian E-Commerce Association (idEA), Sarawak Forestry Corporation, Malaysian National Police (PDRM), Singapore National Parks Board (NParks), Microsoft, Facebook.
Darwin grant value	£360,348.00
Start/end dates of project	1st March 2021 – 31st August 2023
Reporting period (e.g. Apr 2020 – Mar 2021) and number (e.g. Annual Report 1, 2, 3)	1st March 2021 – 31st March 2021 Annual Report 1
Project Leader name	David Roberts
Project website/blog/social media	N/A
Report author(s) and date	David Roberts & Lauren Young, DICE – 30th April 2021

Note: Due to sensitivities surrounding the project (e.g. ensuring effective intelligence gathering and prosecutions of wildlife traffickers and cybercriminals) we ask that this report and the supporting documents are not made public.

1.   Project summary

Indonesia is a mega-biodiversity country, but its abundant biodiversity makes it a major IWT source country in Asia. There are numerous barriers to addressing IWT in Indonesia, which also apply to Malaysia, that generally result from weak capacity or the lack of resources within government agencies. These barriers include: limited capacity to conduct investigative activities such as intelligence gathering and determining key criminals to target; limited understanding of criminal network operations (especially the emergence of online trade); limited knowledge of

protected species identification; poor understanding of the laws pertaining to protected species; and inadequate preparation of legal documents once arrests are made. These problems are compounded by inadequate legal frameworks (especially for cyber-security and online IWT), lack of political will to arrest and prosecute poachers and traders, and general corruption and complicity of certain government officials. Coordination is inadequate between Indonesian government agencies and their transboundary counterparts, especially the close neighbours of Malaysia and Singapore. Preliminary WCS investigations in Indonesia conducted over 12 months in 2017 revealed thriving online IWT. Products sold on the four primary national e-commerce sites monitored were entirely of processed wildlife body parts, e.g. elephant ivory pipes, tiger canines and sun bear claws, whereas on Facebook most surveyed (97%) products sold were of live animals (e.g. Sumatran orangutan, Papuan skinks, birds of paradise), followed by a processed body parts (3%). Thus, to address this burgeoning threat to wildlife, to remove these barriers and to halt this online trafficking, a transnational government-civil society-private sector response is required, alongside training, technical assistance, new tools and technology, and improved communication and coordination in-country and among Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore agencies. This has started through a Borneo island-focused Malaysia-Indonesia Challenge Fund (IWT069) project, and increased collaboration has already resulted in the seizure of 148 hornbill casques in Sabah, Malaysian Borneo.

2.   Project partnerships

In the initial first month of the project, DICE as the leading institution, and WCS as the main NGO partner, have been at the centre of activities. Preliminary discussions were undertaken as soon as the project commenced, resulting in a videoconference on 9th March 2021 between the key project team at DICE and the wider teams at the regional offices of WCS (Indonesia and Malaysia). All project team members were formally introduced, a thorough overview of the project was delivered, and a discussion of the logframe was undertaken. A coordination framework, initial activities, and main points of contact were also agreed (see Annex 4).

As WCS has a long-term (20-30 years) institutional presence and conservation partnerships in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, they have already begun facilitating partnerships with government and non-government organisations in-country. WCS-Indonesia already has a good history of collaborating with law enforcement and the judiciary. WCS-Indonesia is shortly due to begin discussions (e.g. onboarding) with Indonesian National Police (INP), Indonesian Attorney General's Office (AGO) and Indonesian Ministry of Environment and Forestry (MoEF)'s Directorate for Environment and Forestry Law Enforcement (Gakkum), to facilitate partner involvement in project planning and obtain their contribution to the situation analysis (Output 1). WCS-Malaysia is due to undertake the same with Malaysian National Police (PDRM) on 9th April 2021, continuing a 10-year collaborative partnership (see Annex 6). WCS-Indonesia has also begun discussions with Indonesian E-Commerce Association (idEA) to introduce the project and help strengthen private sector partnerships with the social media/e-commerce companies that are most used by wildlife traffickers (Activity 1.2). D. Roberts from DICE met with Dr Benjamin Lee, Director of Wildlife Management Research at Singapore National Parks Board (NParks) on 30th March 2021 regarding their role within the project. NParks have expressed a willingness to reach out to potential additional stakeholders. Driven by lessons learned from WCS's CWT operations, early engagement with these key partners is a crucial step in the project successfully addressing the systemic institutional and capacity barriers that limit effective national-level and transnational actions on IWT in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore.

Other partnerships detailed in the application have not developed significantly in the first month but are expected to do so by the half-year report (31st October 2021).

3.   Project progress

3.1 Progress in carrying out project Activities

<u>Output 1: Enhanced tools for identifying and investigating online IWT developed and tested in 3 Southeast Asian countries.</u>

Activity 1.1. Conduct a situation analysis and needs assessment for the 3 target countries[SEP]

Comments: The research team at DICE has reviewed relevant scientific literature and engaged the expertise of the teams at WCS and NParks to identify the online platforms facilitating IWT in the 3 target countries. A review of each web platform has been undertaken to gather basic data (e.g. language(s), items traded, terms and conditions (to determine any potential limitations for tools), robot coding, and APIs) to aid the subsequent stages of the project and development of tools (see Annex 5). As outlined in section 2, WCS has also begun engaging with in-country partners to assist with the broader situation analysis and needs assessment. The research team at DICE has produced presentation materials that WCS will deliver to in-country law enforcement partners; these materials are designed to facilitate onboarding and open discussions to begin establishing law enforcement needs (see Annex 6). The research team at DICE also undertook a review of existing IWT tools (see Annex 5). A total of 34 tools were identified with capabilities or features relevant to the project (e.g. language analysis, image analysis, acoustic analysis, machine learning, and web scraping). These tools fell into 3 categories: tools that had been designed to identify poaching or IWT activities, including cybercrime; tools that had been designed for the purpose of wildlife conservation that included potentially transferable features or technology for cybercrime tools; and open source intelligence tools (OSINTs). Tools targeting wildlife cybercrime were all in the development or testing stage, and none were designed to tackle online IWT in the 3 target countries. As the project has been running for 1 month we are only in the initial stages of Output 1. However, Activity 1.1 is in progress and is being carried out in the manner and time as originally planned.

Activity 1.2. Develop and strengthen private sector partnerships with the social media/e-commerce companies that are most used by wildlife traffickers[SEP]

Comments: As outlined under Activity 1.1 social media/e-commerce platforms utilised by wildlife traffickers have been identified in the 3 target countries (see Annex 5). Private sector partnerships with these online platforms will be developed over the coming months. WCS-Indonesia has already begun discussions with Indonesian E-Commerce Association (idEA) to help facilitate this. Again this activity is being carried out in the manner and time as originally planned.

Activity 1.3. Develop and subsequently upgrade the tools to enhance law enforcement capacity for gathering, managing and actioning intelligence to target priority online IWT suspects

Comments: As outlined under Activity 1.1 existing IWT tools have been reviewed and law enforcement partners have been engaged to help establish capacity and needs. We have also asked law enforcement partners to provide us with an overview of the legislation on software usage, specifically what they can and cannot use, and if there is any legislation around certain techniques that may prevent them from using tools. Activity 1.3 demands Activities 1.1 and 1.2 to be further progressed before significant progress will be seen, which is in accordance with our original plans.

*Activities under Outputs 2-4 are detailed below but have not yet commenced. They are planned for the later stages of the project.

<u>Output 2: Government, civil society and private sector partners in 3 Southeast Asian countries trained in enhanced investigation and reporting tools.</u>

Activity 2.1. Develop a set of high-quality training modules[SEP]

Activity 2.2. Provide in-country training in project-developed tools

Activity 2.3. Run a regional IWT cybercrime workshop

<u>Output 3: Enhanced online IWT tools applied through a multi-agency approach in 3 Southeast Asian countries.</u>

Activity 3.1. Monitor and analyse online IWT[SEP]

Activity 3.2. Produce Target Intelligence Packages (TIP) and technical assistance to government partners

<u>Output 4: Monitor, evaluate and disseminate results from the project intervention strategy.</u>

Activity 4.1. Evaluate training impacts and enhance training modules to support advanced training[SEP]

Activity 4.2. Monitor and evaluate arrests and prosecutions of online traders based on project generated information[SEP]

Activity 4.3. Submit results in peer-reviewed journal

3.2   Progress towards project Outputs

Our project Outcome is 'Enhanced technological solutions are developed and harnessed with law enforcement against major online IWT networks significantly curtailing exploitation of 100s of threatened and protected Southeast Asian wildlife species'. To achieve this requires understanding the current situation of online IWT and the needs of the project partners to mitigate it, then development of tools and techniques to enable these partners to effectively respond (Output 1). As outlined in section 3.1, despite only being in the very early stages of the project (1 month) we have made good progress towards understanding the current situation and establishing needs as required to achieve Output 1. Measurable indicator 1.1 details 1 online IWT situation analysis report and 1 needs assessment for relevant agencies in each of the 3 countries. These reports are currently being compiled with input from all relevant stakeholders, and it is vital they are completed prior to developing tools (measurable indicator 1.3), the training of key partners in using these tools (Output 2), the application of the tools to monitor online IWT (Output 3), and M&E and dissemination of project results (Output 4). Our project outcome indicators detail that we plan that by 2022, 2 new online tracking tools will have been developed to extract item details and automate search processes, against a baseline of 0. Although at this early stage it is difficult to provide evidence of our progress towards developing the tools required by Output 1, as the reports detailed in measurable indicator 1.1 are a work in progress, we are on track and working within our predicted timeframe.

3.3   Progress towards the project Outcome

Our project Outcome is "Enhanced technological solutions are developed and harnessed with law enforcement against major online IWT networks significantly curtailing exploitation of 100s of threatened and protected Southeast Asian wildlife species." Outcome indicator 0.1 is "By 2022, 2 new tools developed that extract item details and automate the search process, against a baseline of 0." Given that we are only in the early stages of our project the baseline remains at 0. However, the preliminary activities of the project are underway (as detailed in sections 3.1 and 3.2). This indicator will be achieved by 2022 and remains adequate for measuring the intended Outcome of our project. Outcome indicator 0.2 (By 2022, 3 Southeast Asian countries have adopted new and enhanced measures to effectively identify, monitor and take action against major online wildlife traffickers, against a baseline of 0 countries.) is intrinsically linked to indicator 0.1 and therefore the baseline also currently remains at 0. However, this indicator also remains adequate for measuring the intended Outcome and will be achieved in the stated timeframe. The same is true for Outcome indicator 0.3 (From 2021-2023, at least 10 major traffickers of target species from at least 5 major cybercrime networks are being, or have been,

successfully prosecuted, against a baseline of 0 major online traffickers per year from the 3 target countries from the past 10 years.) At the submission of this report we have no concerns over our progress and our project Outcome is on track to be achieved by the end of funding.

3.4   Monitoring of assumptions

Assumption 1: The governments of Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore and key private sector e-commerce and social media companies in the region are committed to reducing online IWT through improving monitoring, policing and cybercrime prosecutions.

Comments: This assumption still holds true. In the situation analysis and needs assessment undertaken so far, the governments and partners engaged have responded positively and proactively. From the preliminary activities (detailed in section 2 of this report) there appears to be a common understanding among all partners of the seriousness of IWT in target countries and transnational connections; and a willingness to collaborate to ensure the tools developed will be based on their needs, thereby improving their effectiveness to tackle online IWT.

Assumption 2: Identified government agencies and private sector are unable to effectively tackle online IWT due to limited knowledge on IWT, lack of technology to tackle cybercrime, limited human resources and/or financial resources.

Comments: This assumption still holds true. The situation analysis and needs assessments have reinforced this assumption; they have highlighted that there are gaps in knowledge, tools, human resources and financial resources of government agencies and private sector partners, which are limiting their capacity to effectively tackle online IWT.

Assumption 3: The governments of Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore are committed to reducing IWT through improving policing (identifying, monitoring and prosecuting online traffickers) and transboundary cooperation to tackle IWT and therefore send the appropriate personnel to be trained.

Comments: We believe this assumption to hold true, although it is important to note that no training has yet taken place. However, given that governments and partners engaged with the project have so far responded positively and proactively, we have no reason to believe their support and uptake will not continue in to the later stages of the project.

Assumption 4: Conserving protected species takes a higher priority for e-commerce companies and responsible government agencies that have a firm commitment to working with UoK and WCS to proactively address online IWT.

Comments: Although the project is only in the early stages, we believe this assumption to hold true. Government partners in the past have proven to become highly motivated by arrests and prosecutions, so we anticipate the project will elicit a similar response.

Assumption 5: Project lessons learned are captured and used to continually improve understanding of IWT and, consequently, greatly advance efforts to reduce cybercrime.

Comments: This assumption still holds true. E-commerce companies have already developed their own initiatives (mainly awareness raising) to address online IWT, which is a positive sign of their motivation to make change; UoK experience from the UK and South Africa has shown that government agencies will independently use UoK developed tools beyond a project lifespan.

3.5   Impact: achievement of positive impact on biodiversity and poverty alleviation

Our project impact is "Empowered government, civil society and private sector to significantly disrupt major online wildlife trafficking networks through enhanced operations within and between Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, thereby delivering substantial biodiversity benefits." Poaching for the wildlife trade remains the greatest threat, or a principal threat, to our highly threatened focal species groups. Vast numbers of species, including our target species, are traded live or as parts and much of the IWT has migrated online, largely as a result of the high internet penetration in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore. For example, WCS cybercrime monitoring in Indonesia over 12 months in 2017 found four sites with 1280 advertisements for the sale of protected species. Although still in the early stages, our project will benefit highly threatened species through significantly improving national law enforcement capacity in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, undertaking targeted actions to remove the key illegal online traders and deterring future actors from IWT engagement through private sector partnerships. Our efforts focus on recovering wild populations through tackling online trafficking. This will include making it increasingly harder to trade online through project partner reforms to their online platforms and with the introduction of new tools and technologies tailored to private sector and government needs. The long-term impact of these efforts on the target species will be a reduction in the numbers taken from the wild, leading to a quicker recovery of these species populations. It is expected to have a long-term positive impact on the biodiversity of the region, along with human wellbeing by safeguarding ecosystem services and limiting the risk of zoonosis transfer associated with IWT (discussed further in section 14).

4. Contribution to the Global Goals for Sustainable Development (SDGs)

Urbanisation is occurring at a rapid pace in Indonesia (60% of the population by 2025) and Malaysia (80% by 2030), while the city state of Singapore reached 100% in 2015. Urban centres have a high demand for threatened species as wild meat, pets, use in medicines or ornamental carvings. The provincial/state capitals also serve as major wildlife trafficking hubs. The growing size, wealth and internet penetration (Indonesia = 65%, Malaysia = 83% and Singapore = 85%) of expanding urban populations is predicted to increase demand for wildlife and its online trade.

Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) SDG11 on 'Sustainable Cities' acknowledges the strain that cities place on resources and the living environment. One of its targets is to reduce the adverse per capita environmental impact of cities by 2030, and to support more positive environmental links between urban and rural areas. Our situation analysis and needs assessment has confirmed a high proportion of online IWT is focused around urban areas in our target countries. Although we are still in the early stages of tool development (Output 1), the work undertaken so far demonstrates good progress towards mitigating the strain cities place on the living environment.

SDG12 on 'Responsible Consumption' highlights the need to ensure consumption is sustainable to reduce future economic, environmental and social costs. The loss of our target species due to overharvesting for the pet trade, ornamental carvings and traditional medicine would result in loss of tourism revenue, have a destabilising effect on ecosystems, and impact rural communities who still rely on their natural resource base for livelihoods and food security. Our situation analysis and needs assessment has begun laying the foundations for our project to tackle online IWTs share of these effects on the ecosystem, by identifying the online platforms utilised by traders, law enforcement needs, and reviewing existing tools and technologies. Similarly these initial stages of the project have contributed towards SDG15 'Life on Land', which aims to prevent the extinction of threatened species by ending trafficking and addressing the demand for illegal wildlife products.

SDG16 on 'Peace, justice and strong institutions' is reflected in our project's commitment to support prosecutors. Although we are only in the initial stages of formally engaging law enforcement agencies, we have begun open discussions and seeking their contribution to the needs assessment.

5. Project support to the Conventions, Treaties or Agreements

We support the following commitments from the 2014 London Conference Declaration: ⌜SEP⌝

I, XIII, XX: Capacity building (including use of new software) and technical assistance are integral to the empowerment and training of civil society and government partners in their ability to detect, confiscate and/or arrest online wildlife traffickers and their illicit goods, in-country and transboundary.

II: We will support governments to destroy evidence of wildlife seized from project induced-actions once it has been used to conclusion in court.

IV: We will enable implementation of best practices by e-commerce and social media sectors; public awareness raising through public and private dialogue; and, market driven self-regulation approaches to improve management that, in return, deters and prevents online IWT transactions and increases detections and convictions.

IX, XXI: Many project activities are specifically designed to address corruption and other forms of mal-governance, and build high-level political support through partnering with state prosecutors in IWT cases.

XI: Through work funded by the IWT Challenge, WCS demonstrated importance of inter-agency cooperation and collaboration in conducting successful CWT operations; Indonesia investigations led to prosecution of 98 wildlife traffickers and in Malaysia seizure of 148 hornbill casques. This project will focus on the online IWT, where much of the trade has migrated, to achieve similar outcomes.

XV, XVII: We will establish transboundary actions and support the political framework to achieve this.

Beyond the 2014 conference, the project supports commitments A1, A3, and C7 of the Kasane Statement, and "Working in Partnership" of the 2018 London Conference Declaration.

The project has not had need to interact with any host country convention focal points, via host country or UK partners in the initial 1 month of the project.

6. Project support to poverty alleviation

According to the World Bank[1], though there has been significant economic progress in Indonesia, 25.1 million people still live below the poverty line. Indonesia is an economically and ethnic diverse country with 273 million people extremely well connected via telecommunications, the internet and social media at all socio-economic levels. This includes:

- 338 million mobile connections, which increased by 15 million (5%) from 2019-2020, and is equivalent to 124% of the total population being connected.

- 175.4 million internet users, which increased by 25 million (17%) from 2019-2020, and with an internet penetration of 64% in 2020.

- 160.0 million social media users, which increased by 12 million (8%) from 2019-2020, with a social media penetration of 59% in 2020.

Indonesia has the world's highest proportion of e-commerce use, with 90% of the country's internet users between the ages of 16 and 64 reporting that they buy products and services online[2]. Increased communications and internet access confer numerous benefits in low income households, such as farmers being empowered by instant access to real time market

---

[1] https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/indonesia/overview
[2] https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2020-indonesia

prices and knowing when to store or sell their commodities in order to increase profits. This empowerment incrementally shifts the balance of power, and is just one example of the ways in which technology can directly contribute to poverty reduction. However, there are also ever increasing risks involved with this widespread telecommunications and internet access. This includes the growth of unmonitored channels whereby organized criminal gangs act with relative impunity, and are well positioned to take advantage of low-resource communities in both urban or rural settings. The unequal power dynamic enables an environment where drugs trafficking, human trafficking and, more recently, wildlife trafficking networks form and flourish. Typically, it is a few individuals that can bring a large negative impact on the communities, thereby impoverishing them further.

WCS has been monitoring the illegal wildlife trade (IWT) in Indonesia since 2003. However, from 2011 it has observed a shift to illegally selling wildlife online through e-commerce and social media sites. The anonymity afforded by the internet creates a new type of IWT seller. In turn, this creates new markets, such as owning exotic pets, which therefore creates a new demand for the supply of certain types of species. WCS has noted the sale of charismatic species, such as baby gibbons, orangutans and wild felids. These species have a high domestic and international tourism draw, upon which rural livelihoods depend, and their poaching in the wild therefore represents a wider, more profound economic loss. This dynamic generates tension and also contributes to social unrest between those who benefit from tourism against those that seek to profit from wildlife trafficking. Furthermore, it creates an insecure environment and niche market for criminality and for vulnerable community groups to be drawn into illegal behaviour, facing the risk of arrest and the associated detrimental economic impacts.

With the recent trend towards greater internet, social media and e-commerce usage and dependency with the COVID-19 outbreak, new social and business networks have been formed and the ability to monitor their safe and legal usage has become harder. This overall situation, stresses the importance of preventing this little known yet flourishing aspect of the IWT and the critical importance of establishing robust national policy frameworks, such as the Government of Indonesia's cybersecurity law, which is currently being drafted, so that an article on wildlife trafficking can be incorporated.

Our project aims to tackle the affluent middlemen and buyers engaged in cyber-enabled IWT, rather than those within poor rural and urban communities who have been drawn into this trade through poverty as the latter can have significant detrimental impacts on the communities. As important, through studying how online IWT networks operate within and amongst Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, our project will, for the first time, gain a much better understanding of the linkage to the rural and urban poor and how this criminal activity affects them.

7.   Consideration of gender equality issues

As the lead, UoK, through its Equality, Diversity and Inclusivity (EDI) team, is committed to the creation and support of a balanced, inclusive and diverse community. This commitment is embedded within the project through promoting and replicating gold-standard EDI practice. UoK and its partner, WCS, have robust non-discrimination policies that are foundational to both organisations and their culture. Throughout the project we will vigorously encourage proportional representation in all of our activities and aim to break down recognised gender barriers. Specifically,

(1) Where government or societal gender imbalances exist, UoK-WCS will take a proactive approach to the inclusion of women. (2) During our capacity-building activities (workshops, meetings), equal representation will be promoted. (3) Disaggregated data will be reported in relation to all project activities. (4) Crime statistics collected during the project will be disaggregated. (5) The role of women in conservation will be promoted during outward facing activities through highlighting women in a variety of roles, including senior positions. (6) At the

UoK, 'Women in Conservation Canterbury Network' (WCCN) has been recently developed. WCCN will, where appropriate, provide mentorship to those working in the project and also those who are external to but interact with the project. This mentorship may include, though not limited to, workplace dynamics, career development and/or engagement with women working in conservation.

Gender equality will be promoted to stakeholders by the direct involvement and project implementation by female WCS staff, including senior positions.

+WCS-Indonesia Country Director and in-country project lead, Dr Andayani, is one of Indonesia's leading conservationists; within WCS-Indonesia several other female staff hold senior positions⸱+WCS-Malaysia, Jenny Machau is operations lead for IWT in Malaysia; supported by a predominantly female team

+WCS Data Analysts and Legal Specialist assigned to this project are all female +WCS-Singapore, Dr Rao, Regional Advisor, is one of Asia's leading CWT experts

8.   Monitoring and evaluation

There have been no changes made to the M&E plan over this reporting period as the project only commenced in March 2021. We are yet to hold our first quarterly evaluation meeting, as required by the original M&E plan. The M&E plan remains as follows:

The project brings together a diverse partner-base and ensuring excellent coordination across the partnership is critical for the robust delivery of activities and to further build political momentum and understanding of the need to tackle IWT. The UoK project lead, Dr David Roberts, with the support of the WCS country leads, Dr Noviar Andayani, Dr Melvin Gumal and Dr Madhu Rao, will conduct the project Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E).

Mechanisms by which M&E will be directly integrated within this project, to ensure timely reporting on indicators and an adaptive management approach to project implementation as follows:

1. UoK will hold quarterly coordination, planning, and evaluation meetings via Skype with all core project staff in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore.⸱2. UoK-WCS will conduct pre- and post-training knowledge assessments to assess the impact of our training programs and track trainees thereafter, through SMS and WhatsApp, to further understand the application of the training content in daily work.⸱3. Tracking of online trading cases, enforcement operations and intelligence sharing will occur through the WCS case-tracking database, building a systematic approach to information gathering on wildlife crime. The database permits a more detailed analysis of the impacts of individual arrests on the organization and operations of criminal networks, which will enable us to advise enforcement agencies in targeting subsequent enforcement actions.⸱4. Converting intelligence data into enforcement action is a key goal of this project. As such, in addition to the formal indicators, a unique role of WCS's field programs, especially in Indonesia and Malaysia, will be to independently monitor the situation on the ground, thereby enabling us to evaluate and effectively direct support to government agencies in the most effective way.⸱5. Gender equality during engagement with stakeholders and events (eg workshops, meetings etc) will be monitored throughout the project using gender disaggregated data.

More specifically, the project leads will oversee the compilation and analysis of data for all project indicators. The IWT Training Specialist will oversee all training events (Activities #2.1-2.3), including the compilation of participant survey data that will be used to evaluate all training (#4.1). Working with UoK, the WCS leads from Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore will be responsible for the M&E of in-country activities and assessments and handling the IWT tracking data generated (all activities). The WCS IWT Legal Specialist will monitor law enforcement operations and court cases (#4.2), compiling information on the agencies involved, the location, evidence confiscated, number and types of people arrested, and then the outcome of court cases etc. The WCS IWT Program Manager and Regional IWT Experts will oversee the implementation of Output 4 activities (#4.1-4.3) and their M&E data. The WCS IWT Field officers will provide more general support for all the project activities, which will include

supporting M&E tasks. The costs for these M&E tasks are built into the salary costs of the named staff and because data.

9.   Lessons learnt

As we are only in the first month of our project there have been no notable lessons learnt.

10.   Actions taken in response to previous reviews (if applicable)

N/A – this is the first review submitted on behalf of the project.

11.   Other comments on progress not covered elsewhere

As the project is in the very early stages there has been no need or opportunities to enhance or refine the methods of the project. Nor have there been any significant difficulties or associated risks.

12.   Sustainability and legacy

Our efforts over the first month of the project in relation to its profile have been primarily focussed on strengthening relationships with project partners. As outlined in section 2 and 3.1, WCS has begun engaging with in-country partners to assist with the situation analysis and needs assessment. DICE has undertaken the same with NParks. With assistance from the research team at DICE, WCS will shortly deliver presentations to in-country law enforcement partners to facilitate onboarding. These efforts have resulted in increased interest from the governments and partners. This increased interest is expected to become more tangible in future activities, (e.g. across Outputs 1-3). Increased capacity is also expected to result from future activities, as the project has a strong emphasis on capacity building, which is highlighted in our Exit Strategy. Currently we are in the early stages of our activities but as detailed in our original open access plan we are committed to the open sharing of analytical outputs, policy briefings, research findings, training manuals and reports, once final.

Our original Exit Strategy is still valid and is as follows:

This project has been specifically designed to establish a broad partnership of government agencies dedicated to combating online IWT in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, facilitated by UoK-WCS. Through working with the law enforcement agencies at a high political level, building considerations of wildlife crime into national-level training courses (and for Indonesia, its national cyber-security strategy) and improving regional understanding of IWT, the project will mainstream action to combat IWT into "business as usual". This will ensure that results are not dependent upon individual interests and capacities, and instead become part of the enforcement culture.

The strong project emphasis on capacity building (including the production of IWT cybercrime training modules), transfer of knowledge and innovative tools (in particular UoK custom built user-friendly online investigation technology), enabling improved inter-agency cooperation and new government-private sector partnerships, as well as providing cybercrime investigation technical assistance represents a sustainable and unprecedented investment for combatting online IWT both in-country and transnationally for Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore. The low cost solutions to effectively reduce online IWT enable financial sustainability. Here, UoK-WCS will work through government agencies and mechanisms so that project outcomes are mainstreamed into the regular operations and budgets of these agencies.

13.   Darwin identity

Our in-country partners have a good understanding of the Darwin Initiative via their involvement with our project from the outset, including Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS), Indonesian National Police (INP), Malaysian National Police (PDRM), and Singapore National Parks Board (NParks). WCS has also introduced the project to British High Commission in Malaysia and the UK Embassy in Indonesia. Given that the project is very much in the opening stages, we have not publicised the Darwin Initiative further nor formally recognized the UK Government's contribution. Due to sensitivities surrounding the project (e.g. ensuring effective intelligence gathering and prosecutions of wildlife traffickers and cybercriminals) we do not intend to do so for the duration of the funding period.

14.   Impact of COVID-19 on project delivery

We had initially planned to start our project on 1st April 2020. However, to ensure the personal wellbeing of all participants and to ensure the project had maximum impact from the outset we felt it was best to delay in the face of the emerging global COVID-19 pandemic. A request was submitted and granted for a new start date of 1st March 2021. Apart from this delay we do not expect there to be any longer-term delays associated with COVID-19. As we are currently in the initial stages of the project, the majority of the workload to date has been centralised around strengthening key partnerships and conducting the initial situation analysis and needs assessment. Given that the nature of our project is online IWT, activities to date and the majority of our future work can be conducted remotely (i.e. via remote working and online videoconferencing) and in strict accordance with local/regional COVID restrictions. All participants have been instructed to adhere to local/regional restrictions. Future in-person activities, such as in-country partner training workshops and regional workshops (Output 2), are not expected to take place until our tools to tackle online IWT have been developed (Output 1); our indicators predict by 2022. We remain hopeful that by this time a degree of normality will have returned to facilitate in-person training. However, in the event this is not the case, we will consider hosting the workshops online. The UoK has significant capacity to assist in this area, as over the last they have delivered entire degrees online. You will also note from our original M&E plan that our quarterly coordination, planning, and evaluation meetings were from the outset were to be conducted via Skype. Likewise pre- and post-training knowledge assessments to assess the impact of our training programs were to be conducted via SMS and WhatsApp. Similarly WCS leads from Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore will be responsible for the M&E of in-country activities and WCS IWT Field officers will provide more general support for all the project activities, reducing the need for unnecessary travel and the associated risks of COVID-19. WCS has been implementing its country-specific COVID-19 mitigation plans since March 2020, which has enabled its team to continue to operate in the field, albeit with a lower effort. Most of the government meetings and trainings have been conducted online. Since the beginning of 2021, a limited number of in-person government meetings and trainings have been conducted and are steadily increasing.

Our project's outcomes and impacts could reduce the risk of future pandemics. Numerous emerging infectious diseases have been linked to wildlife trade, including some Ebola outbreaks and HIV. In terms of the COVID-19 pandemic, the link is yet to be conclusively proven. However, it is believed by many to be a direct result of our increased contact and proximity to animals, specifically in this instant, wildlife for sale in regional markets. The online wildlife trade increases the risk of spreading zoonosis to buyers, poachers and traffickers. Online platforms provide a quicker connection between supply and demand, increasing the likelihood of disease transfer, and enable traders to target an increased and more widely distributed number of buyers. Poaching for the wildlife trade not only threatens our focal species groups but also increasingly presents threats to human wellbeing. Vast numbers of species, including our target species, are traded live or as parts and much of the IWT has migrated online, largely as a result of the high internet penetration in Indonesia, Malaysia and

Singapore. IWT specifically is also more prone to infectious diseases due to the high density of specimens during transport along the trade chain. The global reach of the Internet extends the reach of IWT. It also extends the reach of potential zoonosis, both in terms of the speed of disease transfer and the likelihood of it occurring. By significantly improving national law enforcement capacity in Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore, and undertaking targeted actions to remove the key illegal online traders and deter future actors from IWT, our project will both greatly reduce the numbers of target species taken from the wild, and the risks of future pandemics like COVID-19.

15.   Safeguarding

Please tick this box if any safeguarding or human rights violations have occurred during this financial year.   ☐

If you have ticked the box, please ensure these are reported to ODA.safeguarding@defra.gov.uk as indicated in the T&Cs.

16.   Project expenditure

Table 1: Project expenditure <u>during the reporting period</u> (1 April 2020 – 31 March 2021)

Project spend (indicative) since last annual report	2020/21 Grant (£)	2020/21 Total Darwin Costs (£)	Variance %	Comments (please explain significant variances)
Staff costs (see below)	■	■	■	Due to exceptional circumstances beyond our control, our partners WCS are unable to claim the costs they have incurred for this project. This situation was also impaired by the project only having been operational for 1 month. We will shortly be submitting a request to reallocate the unspent sums to the next financial year.
Consultancy costs	■	■	■	As above
Overhead Costs	■	■	■	As above
Travel and subsistence	■	■	■	As above
Operating Costs	■	■	■	As above
Capital items (see below)	■	■	■	As above
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E)	■	■	■	N/A
Others (see below)	■	■	■	As above
TOTAL	■	■	■	

Checklist for submission

	Check
Is the report less than 10MB? If so, please email to Darwin-Projects@ltsi.co.uk putting the project number in the Subject line.	Yes
Is your report more than 10MB? If so, please discuss with Darwin-Projects@ltsi.co.uk about the best way to deliver the report, putting the project number in the Subject line.	N/A
Have you included means of verification? You should not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report.	Yes
Do you have hard copies of material you need to submit with the report? If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number. However, we would expect that most material will now be electronic.	N/A
Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors	Yes
Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully?	Yes
Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report.	